

**City of Orange Township
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes
February 15, 2023**

This is a meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Orange Township held via audio-video conferencing on Wednesday, February 15, 2023, at 7:01 p.m.

The Pledge of Allegiance to the American Flag was led by Commissioner Jody Leight.

ROLL CALL

Present	Commissioner Keith Carroll Commissioner Kathy Dowd Commissioner Jody Leight Commissioner Janice Morrell
Also Present	Joyce L. Lanier, Secretary Janine Bauer, Counsel Trisha Scipio, Administrative Staff
Absent	Commissioner Brandon Matthews Commissioner Troy Simmons Commissioner Abdiel Velez Commissioner Karen Wells

The Secretary announced the requirement of N.J.S.A. 10:4-9 et. seq., “Sunshine Law” has been met. A notice of this meeting was sent to the Star Ledger, published in the Record Transcript on November 20, 2022 posted on the Council’s website (www.orangetwpnjcc.org), the City’s website (www.orangenj.gov) and filed in the Office of the City Clerk.

MEETING MINUTES

January 18, 2023, Meeting Minutes (Commissioner Jody Leight, Commissioner Brandon Matthews, and Commissioner Abdiel Velez were absent and should abstain)

A motion to adopt the January 18, 2023, Meeting Minutes, was made by Commissioner Kathy Dowd and seconded by Commissioner Keith Carroll

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, and Commissioner Janice Morrell
Nay: None
Abstain: Commissioner Jody Leight
Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons, and
Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

PUBLIC HEARING

The Secretary announced the public will be allowed to question witnesses testifying on behalf of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, after the presentation is completed and after questions from the Commission. During the public hearing on the Application, the public will be allowed to comment on any new Certificate of Appropriation Application upon completion of the Applicant’s presentation and questions from the Commission. Each person addressing the Commission shall give his or her name and address in an audible tone for the record, and unless further time is granted by the presiding officer shall limit his or her address to five (5) minutes unless the comments are repetitive of other witnesses in which case the presiding officer may further limit the comment period.

In the absence of Chairman Troy Simmons, Vice Chairman Keith Carroll led the meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

- A. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – A2151-23**
406 Clarendon Place, Block 4902, Lot 1, Montrose Seven Oaks Park Historic District
(Paint Garage, Replace garage door, window and shingles) (Owner – Steven Dowd, Kathy Cooper)
(Public Hearing)

Janine Bauer, Esq., alerted the Commissioners and the public that the applicant, Kathy Dowd is a Commissioner for the Historic Preservation Commission and she would be testifying as a fact witness and not judging this application as she is disqualified to judge. Commissioners should treat Ms. Dowd without sympathy or favoritism. Kathy Dowd was sworn in by Janine Bauer, Esq., Board Attorney.

Kathy Dowd prefaced her information that the application was being submitted after some of the repairs were completed. The applicants employed a contractor to look at the garage because it was shifting and unstable. In order to do the repairs, the contractor needed to remove the siding and shingles of the garage. The garage was reframed, the footing was remedied, and the garage was put back together. Cedar siding was installed on the left side of the garage which is visible to the street. The window and door was also replaced on the left side. Pine siding was installed on the right side. After these items were complete the applicant received notice from the construction office that they needed to obtain a permit, and in order to receive a permit they must file an application with the Historic Preservation Commission. The roof was replaced with asphalt shingles which is the original material. This was a reconstruction of both sides of the garage. The size, the foot print, and the roof are exactly the same. The only difference is that the left side was replaced with cedar instead of pine.

A motion to approve the application Nunc pro tunc as a reconstruction of the left and right sides of the garage with a new roof based on the fact that like kind materials were used and all the same dimensions were kept for the window and door. The only difference being the cedar siding used on the left side and the right side remained pine was made by Commissioner Keith Carroll and seconded by Commissioner Janice Morrell.

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Jody Leight, and Commissioner Janice Morrell
Nay: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons,
Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

- B. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – A2152-23**
436 New England Terrace, Block 4103, Lot 10, Montrose Seven Oaks Historic District
(Replace Windows) (Chaz Hills Dozier – Home Depot/Scott Doughman Contractor)
(Public Hearing)

Chaz Hills Dozier, Jose Ruiz, and Andrew Petrides the Home Depot Representative, were all sworn in by Janine Bauer, Esq., Board Attorney.

Mr. Chaz Hills Dozier stated that the home was just purchased two months ago and discovered the ten window in the front are storm windows which means they are not the most energy efficient or visually pleasing. They contacted Home Depot to replace the windows and during the course of getting an estimate, they discovered they needed to appear before the Historic Preservation Commission. There are five panels with ten windows. Andrew Petrides stated there are ten double hung windows. What is

currently installed is temporary windows. The windows are visible from the street. Two, Three and Four or visible from the street. The windows will be hung with insulated double hung windows. The purpose is two-fold, to improve the look and to increase the efficiency of the house. The windows will be white interior and exterior and the same dimensions as windows currently installed. Window one is installed on the front left side of the house – the door is actually on the left side of the house.

A motion to approve the application as submitted per the plans, pictures and the Home Depot specifications in the Home Improvement was made by Commissioner Keith Carroll and seconded by Commissioner Kathy Dowd

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, Commissioner Jody Leight, and Commissioner Janice Morrell

Nay: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons, Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

TECHNICAL REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

A. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – A1181-23

531 Valley Street, Block 6008, Lot 9, Orange Valley Historic District

(Solar Panels: Install rooftop solar mount) (Ardell Long Temple – Owner/ Brook Wilson – Orbit Solar Contractor)

Commissioner Jody Leight was present for the TRC meeting. The applicant submitted a revised plan and eliminated panels on the porch roof. The plan contained no panels that were visible from the street. The committee is recommending that the application be approved as revised. Commissioner Janice Morrell stated the original and subsequent revised plans – irrespective of where you were from the street view, the panels would have been visible. The last revised plans will not have panels visible from the street view.

A motion to approve the application to locate 22 solar panels on the main roof of the house with the final revision eliminating the four panels on the front porch lower roof was made by Commissioner Keith Carroll and seconded by Commissioner Janice Morrell

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, Commissioner Jody Leight, and Commissioner Janice Morrell

Nay: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons, Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

B. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – C11165-2022
605 Nassau Street, Block 5004, Lot 39, Orange Valley Historic District
(Repair roof of front porch, repair porch) (Owner – Christian Lliguicota)
(November Meeting | Referred to TRC)

This applicant never produced the permits as previously stated in the January meeting. The applicant gave sworn testimony that the contractor was in possession of a permit but it was found that a permit was not issued and the building department issued a fine for having proceeding without a permit. This is a design guideline violation.

A motion to deny the application was made by Commissioner Jody Leight and seconded by Commissioner Keith Carroll.

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, Commissioner Jody Leight, and Commissioner Janice Morrell

Nay: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons, Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted: Application Denied

RESOLUTIONS

8-2023 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION GRANTING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 531 VALLEY STREET, CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP, N.J., WHICH IS BLOCK 6008, LOT 9 ON THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP TAX MAP, TO INSTALL ROOF-TOP SOLAR PANELS

A motion to adopt Resolution 8-2023 was made by Commissioner Kathy Dowd and seconded by Commissioner Keith Carroll

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, and Commissioner Janice Morrell

Nay: None

Abstain: Commissioner Jody Leight

Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons, Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

9-2023 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION DENYING THE APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 605 NASSAU STREET IN THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP, N.J., WHICH IS BLOCK 5004, LOT 39 ON THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP TAX MAP, FOR A PREVIOUSLY CONSTRUCTED ENCLOSED FRONT PORCH.

A motion to adopt Resolution 9-2023 was made by Commissioner Kathy Dowd and seconded by Commissioner Janice Morrell

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, and Commissioner Janice Morrell
Nay: None
Abstain: Commissioner Jody Leight
Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons,
Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

OTHER BUSINESS

A. Memo regarding Protocol for Ordinary Maintenance and Minor Work to be performed on buildings in the Historic Districts. Commissioner Janice Morrell stated some of the work done on Clarendon was ordinary maintenance and inquired why the Commission went through the process. Board Attorney Janine Bauer, Esq. stated because it was a reconstruction.

B. Memo to Wanny Manasse – 480 Heywood Avenue. - dated January 22, 2023

A motion to table this discussion was made by Commissioner Keith Carroll and seconded by Commissioner Janice Morrell

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, and Commissioner Janice Morrell
Nay: None
Abstain: Commissioner Jody Leight
Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons,
Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

ZONING OFFICER APPROVAL:

There were no Zoning Officer Approvals.

PENDING BUSINESS

A. Grant application – Update

Commissioner Karen Wells was assigned to work with the grant writer and absent at this meeting.

A motion to table this item was made by Commissioner Janice Morrell and seconded by Commissioner Keith Carroll.

Roll Call

Yea: Commissioner Keith Carroll, Commissioner Kathy Dowd, and Commissioner Janice Morrell
Nay: None
Abstain: Commissioner Jody Leight
Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews, Commissioner Troy Simmons,
Commissioner Abdiel Velez, and Commissioner Karen Wells

Motion Adopted

ADJOURN MEETING

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Commissioner Kathy Dowd and seconded by Commissioner Keith Carroll

The meeting was adjourned at 7:47 pm.

The next Historic Preservation Commission Meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, March 15, 2023 virtually at 7:00 p.m.

Approved: March 15, 2023

Joyce L. Lanier
HPC Secretary

Keith Carroll
Vice Chairman