

***City of Orange Township  
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes***

***June 19, 2019***

The Secretary announced that this is a meeting of Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Orange Township held at City Hall in Council Chambers, 29 North Day Street, Orange, New Jersey on Wednesday, June 19, 2019 at 7:43 p.m.

The Secretary asked all to stand for the Pledge of Allegiance to the American Flag.

**ROLL CALL**

**Present:** Commissioner Keith Carroll  
Commissioner Kathy Dowd  
Commissioner Jody Leight  
Commissioner Janice Morrell Arrived at 8:02 p.m.  
Commissioner Karen Wells

**Also Present:** Joyce L. Lanier, Secretary  
Janine Bauer, Esq.  
Shawna Ebanks, Nishuane Group

**Absent:** Commissioner Brandon Matthews  
Commissioner Abdiel Velez  
Commissioner Troy Simmons  
Richard Wolff, Zoning Officer

The Secretary stated that the requirement of N.J.S.A. 10:4-9 et. seq., “Sunshine Law” has been met. A notice of this meeting was published in the Record-Transcript, sent to the Star Ledger on December 28, 2018, posted on the Bulletin Board in City Hall and filed in the Office of the City Clerk.

Secretary advised that the Order of Business has been changed.

**NEW BUSINESS**

**E. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – Board of Education – 376 Claredon Place, Orange, N.J. (existing conditions and demolition plan for Orange High School Claredon Place Parking Lot)**

Ronald C. Hunt, Esq. (Partner of the Law Firm of Hunt, Hamlin & Ridley – counsel for the Board of Education); Adekunle James (Board of Education), and Roderick Watkins (Architect) appeared. Mr. Watkins presented for the Orange Board of Education and swore that the testimony he was about to give was the truth.

On May 19, 2019, the Orange Board of Education appeared before the OHPC regarding 376 Claredon Place, which property was being demolished without the approval of the OPHC nor a demolition permit. Therefore, the demolition was ceased by the Construction Official and a fine was issued. In addition, the OHPC asked the Orange Board of Education to mothball 386 Claredon Place.

Since the last meeting, the Technical Committee meet with the Orange Board of Education, and a list was agreed upon by all parties and work has begun. Mr. Watkins has also confirmed that 376 Claredon has been demolished.

Now, the Orange Board of Education is seeking approval of an amended proposed site plan for the parking lot which includes Lots 3, 4 and 5 of Block 4902. The proposed plan provides an additional 59 parking spaces (totaling 117 spaces), 2 handicap spaces, a curb cut, two-way entrance and exit, 9 feet LED shield light poles, walkways and a soil erosion plan. Mr. Watkins advised drainage has been properly addressed with two seepage pits for water to go into and that when full will slowly percolate out. The parking lot will have a swing gate, which will be locked by school security guards at the end of each day. On Claredon Place, there will be a wrought iron and a wood fence on the sides.

Attorney Bauer expressed the concerns of the OHPC with the drainage of the parking lot and requested that Mr. Watkins submit the calculations to capture all of the storm water. Mr. Watkins advised calculations for all of the storm waters have been done and will provide the same to the OHPC. Attorney Hunt advised money was earmarked for the project, but they will look into how much it will cost to capture all of the storm water and report back.

The OHPC has requested that all plans be clearly specified and details be made in writing. Attorney Hunt has agreed to do so and acknowledged that no action will be taken on the remaining buildings without prior application to the OHPC. Attorney Bauer advised an agreement will be reached and memorialized at the next meeting.

Motion granting relief requested on the application filed for tax Block 4902, Lots 3, 4 and 5 as represented by the plans prepared by French & Perrello which consist of 8 drawings and the preexisting drawing with respect to fence on other sides of the property. The Board of Education will consider accommodating all storm water and will get back to the OHPC.

**Motion: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

**Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**MEETING MINUTES**

- **May 15, 2019 Meeting Minutes**

**Motion: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

**Second: Commissioner Jody Leight**

***(Commissioners Matthews and Velez were not in attendance and cannot vote.)***

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**CONTINUATION OF NEW BUSINESS**

- A. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 205 South Jefferson Street, Orange, N.J. (Complete demolition of rotted wood in exception of foundation and a portion of the front porch. New framing and addition to the back.) (*Rescheduled from the May 15, 2019 Meeting*)**

The Applicant, Mr. Jose Flores, is the owner of the property at 205 South Jefferson Street. The Applicant spoke through his representative Contractor. Mr. Jaime Gualpa, of MJ and Sons Construction

A survey prepared by Schmidt Surveying dated 1/17/2019 was submitted and marked as Exhibit A-1, along with photographs of the house in its existing condition, and a set of plans (four sheets) prepared by Zen Architecture & Engineering of Elizabeth, N.J. dated 3/11/2019.

The applicant wants to completely rebuild a 2 1/2 story dwelling on a raised foundation, and add a two story addition. Mr. Gualpa advised that the framing and sheathing wood is rotted. The addition will create a master first floor and enlarge the three bedrooms on the second floor.

Mr. Gualpa advised that the property will remain a single family home and will be rebuilt with same type of materials to keep its historic aesthetic. The OHPC did not approve the vinyl siding. The front and back porches will both remain open.

Motion to grant the relief requested in application to completely rebuild a 2 ½ story dwelling on a raised foundation, and to erect a two story rear addition in accordance with the plans submitted with the application.

***Roll Call Vote***

**Motion: Commissioner Kathy Dowd**

**Second: Commissioner Jody Leight**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	

**Motion passed.**

**B. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 459 Lincoln Place, Orange, N.J. (open porch to return to original status) (Rescheduled from the May 15, 2019 Meeting)**

The Applicant is Conley Realty, and Ms. Taiesha Murchison is the owner of Conley Realty.

The property is a single family residence in the Montrose-Seven Oaks Historic District. The Applicant seeks to open up the front porch which is currently enclosed, and to return it to its original state, using the same or similar materials as much as possible.

Mr. Charles Conley appeared on behalf of the applicant. He is the husband and contractor of the applicant and advised the vinyl siding cladding the front porch enclosure will be removed, the porch railing will be replaced with PVC, the original wood columns supporting the porch roof will remain and that the flashing and other materials will be removed from the wood columns, and the new floor decking will be pressure-treated wood. Mr. Conley provided the OHPC with photographs of what the porch looks like in the enclosed state, and a neighboring property with an open porch.

Motion to approve the application to open the front porch to return it to its original state, using the same or similar materials as much as possible.

**Roll Call Vote**

**Motion: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

**Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd**

**Roll Call**

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**C. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 481 Lincoln Place, Orange, N.J. (move the stairs to get a new door and create a parking area)**

Valandy Julceus appeared and translated for the applicant his dad, Evariste Julceus. The proposed project is to remove and relocate the stairs on the other side of the property to create a parking spot.

Contractor Segundo F. Barrera testified that the parking area is 10 ft x 56 ft long.

Attorney Bauer advised that a zoning variance for side and front yard set-back may be needed from the Zoning Board. Therefore, she recommended to the OHPC that the application be postponed to the next meeting until the applicant gets clearance from zoning.

Application will be rescheduled for July 17, 2019.

**D. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 409 Valley Street, Orange, N.J. (installation of 9.15 KW photovoltaic solar system)**

Mr. James and Mr. Gonzalez appeared as the representatives for the owner Nordia Raymond who has contracted Whitman Construction to install solar panels on her main roof.

A letter from Douglas G. Penoyer, P.E., was introduced into evidence affirming the roof is in good enough condition to bear the load of the solar panels, which included photographs, plans and drawings.

Motion to grant applicant’s request to install solar panels on the roof in accordance with the plans submitted with the application. The Commission finds the solar panels while visible from the street, will not be obtrusive and will not change the historic character of the building, or district, and that a deviation from the Historic District Design Guidelines is warranted.

**Motion: Commissioner Jody Leight**

**Second: Commissioner Karen Wells**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**E. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 564 Forest Street, Orange, N.J. (installation of new windows)**

Ms. Natalie Warfield appeared as the representative for the applicant Ilya Brodsky, who wants to replace windows on the second floor of this vacant building. The building originally had large double hung wood windows that were each divided into many panes. Ms. Warfield showed the Commission a photograph of one of the windows that is still remaining in the building. The owner seeks to replace all of the windows in the building because the window areas are open, with no window at all, or if there is a window or partial window, the wood is rotten. The weather is affecting the building because the elements (rain etc.) are getting inside. Additionally, without windows the building is not safe or secure; the openings present a hazard. The owner intends to install windows that look like the original windows with metal rather than wood frames and sashes.

No other work is planned at this time and the owner has not decided how to adapt or re-purpose the building except that it will likely be for mixed use with retail on the first floor and apartment above. Ms. Warfield was cautioned to investigate the extent of the 100-year flood plain and NJDEP restrictions on first floor commercial and/or residential uses in the floodplain before proceeding very far in planning uses for the first floor, or the entire building because of access, ingress and egress issues (access may have to be raised).



**Motion: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

**Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight			X		
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell					
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**8-2019 A resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness for 298 Fuller Terrace, Block 4802, Lot 1 to replace windows and install new porch handrails.**

**Motion: Commissioner Kathy Dowd**

**Second: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight			X		
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**9-2019 A resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness for 248 Roberts Road, Block 5303, Lot 7, to install vinyl siding and cultured stone brick face.**

**Motion: Commissioner Janice Morrell**

**Second: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**10-2019 A resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness for 285 Lincoln Avenue a/k/a 427 New England Terrace, Block 4101, Lots 9 and 11, to remove and construct a new retaining wall, erect a fence, install landscaping and a parking lot in accordance with the plans submitted with the application.**

**Motion: Commissioner Karen Wells**

**Second: Commissioner Keith Carroll**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

**Motion passed.**

**VIII. OTHER BUSINESS**

- **Need for recordation pursuant to prior demolitions according to the HABS/HAER standard in use in New Jersey.**

Attorney Bauer spoke about the OHPC applications and suggested that revisions to the guidelines be considered to include recordation requirements. She will work on a draft.

**IX. PENDING BUSINESS**

**None.**

**Adjourn Meeting:**

**Motion to Adjourn: Commissioner Janice Morrell**

**Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd**

***Roll Call***

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell					
Commissioner Troy Simmons				X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				


**Motion passed.**

**Adjournment Time: 9:43 p.m.**



*Next Regular Meeting is scheduled for July 17, 2019 at 7:30 p.m. at City Hall Council Chamber, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, Orange, N.J.*

**APPROVED:**



---

**Joyce L. Danier**  
Secretary



---

**Keith Carroll**  
Chair