

**THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

**DATE: JANUARY 17, 2018**

**NUMBER: 26-2017**

**ORIGINAL APPLICATION DATE: APRIL 19, 2017**

**RECONSIDERED DATE: NOVEMBER 29, 2017**

**TITLE: A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF ORANGE TOWNSHIP HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION GRANTING CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO LEON BROWN, FOR BLOCK 6202, LOT 22 TO RESTORE THE BASE STRUCTURE, MISSING SHINGLES AND DECK INCLUDING POSTS AND STAIRS AND RESTORE REAR OF STRUCTURE**

**WHEREAS**, Leon Brown, the manager of 664 Valley Street (“Applicant”), has applied to the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Orange Township for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for work to be done on the property of David Goldstein, 8 East Bourne Drive, Chestnut Ridge, New York, located at 664 Valley Street, Orange, New Jersey, and designated as Block 6202, Lot 22 on the Tax Map of the City of Orange Township; and

**WHEREAS**, the Application was originally filed and heard by the Historic Preservation Commission on April 19, 2017 and grated and memorialized the following month; and

**WHEREAS**, the Applicant Leon Brown appeared before the Commission on November 29, 2017, and asked the Commission to reconsider its prohibition on vinyl siding as cladding for the subject property because of the extensive rot of the existing wood cladding, and for other relief; and

**WHEREAS**, the Commission listened to the Applicant’s testimony; and

**WHEREAS**, the Application was the subject of public notice by virtue of the publication of the agenda of the Historic Preservation Commission, and all members of the Commission voting on this resolution have attended the public hearing(s) or have certified that they have read the transcript(s) or listened to the tape(s) of the hearing pursuant to N.J.S.A. 40:55D-10.2; and

**WHEREAS**, the Commission reviewed the application and plan(s) (if any) and any other submission of the Applicant and is granting partial approval in reliance upon the representations made in the Applicant’s testimony in the public presentation by the Applicant; and

**WHEREAS**, the Commission, after carefully considering the evidence submitted by the Applicant, its own professionals and City’s professional staff, and the general public, makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law:

**I. FINDINGS OF FACT**

- A. On the subject property, Block 6202, Lot 22, located at 664 Valley St., situated in the Orange Valley Historic District, is a purported three-family residence, which has been abandoned and is vacant according to the Applicant.
- B. The house was constructed in 1892.
- C. Based upon the representations of the Applicant, Leon Brown, who is the manager of the property, at the first hearing on this Application, the Commission was led to believe that Mr. Brown would restore the home to its original state, will repair or replace the rotting or rotten materials with like kind wood materials and shingles, and would bring it up to code.

- D. Based on the foregoing, the Commission found that the Application was in order and it was appropriate to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness approval. The Applicant was complimented on the Application because of the numerous photographs presented and Plan set including detailed drawings.
- E. On November 29, 2017, the Applicant testified that the wood was extensively rotted and that he wanted to clad the home in vinyl siding. He asked the Commission for certain relief from the earlier approval. The Commission explained that that change to vinyl siding would do violence to the master plan and the zoning plan and to the historic district and to the home's aesthetic and its and the district's integrity, and that vinyl siding is not allowed in the historic district for these and other reasons.
- F. The Commission denied that portion of the relief requested from the earlier Certificate of Appropriateness granted, relating to vinyl siding. In light of this denial, Mr. Brown agreed to apply wood cladding to the home, all the way around it, on the record at the public hearing.
- G. Mr. Brown also testified that the existing windows are vinyl replacement windows, but that the wood frame is intact, and he agreed to leave the wood frames intact, as well as any other distinguishing wood features such as the fish scale design etc.
- H. The Applicant further requested guidance on the front steps and front porch. The Commission required that the porch be maintained as wood, and that the front steps be replaced with wood from the front porch floor down to the grade surface. The Commission agreed that the interior sidewalk could be concrete or bluestone and that, at the change in grade in the front yard, the interior sidewalk should be stone, masonry or concrete, with a wrought iron railing. The Commission required that the front steps have a railing or banister made of wood and that the new steps should be expanded in width (compared to the existing steps) to meet these two features of the front porch: the newel post on one side and the column on the other side of the steps.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- A. The Commission first finds that the Applicant did not demonstrate by virtue of the Application and accompanying materials that the application of vinyl siding would not impair the historic significance of the district, will not encroach upon nearby properties within the historic district, and will not cause substantial detriment to the public good and will not substantially impair the intent and the purpose of the zone plan and zoning ordinance. In fact, the Commission finds that vinyl siding would be such a detriment, encroachment and detriment.
- B. Therefore, a Certificate of Appropriateness will not issue and is hereby denied with respect to Applicant's requested relief for vinyl siding.
- C. The Commission and Applicant agree to the following with respect to the porch millwork, front steps and interior walkway and lower-grade steps and banisters: wood steps with a wood banister, from the front porch to the grade surface, expanded in width to meet the porch newel post and column, with a concrete or blue stone interior pathway until the grade change closer to the street, the steps of which may be concrete, stone or masonry with a wrought iron railing.
- D. All windows currently framed out in wood shall remain framed out in wood and all wood windows and frames shall be maintained and repaired or replaced with wood only.
- E. The Commission expresses no opinion and makes no determination as to the use of this property as a three-family residence. This is not a zoning approval.
- F. The Other Conditions of Approval in the previously granted Certificate of Appropriateness remain intact.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, by the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission that the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work described in the Application and in testimony is hereby DENIED with respect to the vinyl siding. Applicant shall follow the Commission's further approval with respect to the porch, front steps and interior pathway.

**III. SATISFACTION OF CONDITIONS**

This approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness shall not be deemed satisfied and construction permits shall not be issued until such time as the Director of the Department of Public Works and/or his designee and/or the City Engineer finds that all conditions of approval have been satisfied.

**ROLL CALL ON THE MOTION TO APPROVE:**

	Yes	No	Absent	NP
Keith Carrol	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	_____
Kathy Dowd (2d)	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Jody Leight (moved)	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Brandon Matthews	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Bruce Meyer	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	_____
Janice Morrell	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	_____
Yolanda Silverio	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	_____
Troy Simmons	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Abdiel Velez	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Karen Wells	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____

**MEMORIALIZATION:**

This Resolution adopted this 17 of January 2018 memorializes the action taken at a meeting of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission with the roll call vote on the memorialization as follows:

	Yes	No	Absent	NP
Keith Carrol	_____	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>
Kathy Dowd (2d)	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Jody Leight	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Brandon Matthews (moved)	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Bruce Meyer	_____	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>
Janice Morrell	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	<u>  x  </u>
Yolanda Silverio	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	<u>  x  </u>
Troy Simmons	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Abdiel Velez	<u>  x  </u>	_____	_____	_____
Karen Wells	_____	_____	<u>  x  </u>	_____

I hereby certify that the foregoing is a true copy of a Resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission memorialized on January 17, 2018.

Adopted:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Joyce Lanier  
Secretary

\_\_\_\_\_  
Troy Simmons  
Chair