City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

April 19, 2017

The Secretary announced that this is a meeting of Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Orange Township held at City Hall in Council Chambers, 29 North Day Street, Orange New Jersey on Wednesday, April 19, 2017 at 7:38 PM.

The Secretary asked all to stand for Pledge of Allegiance to the American Flag

ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioner Keith Carrol

Commissioner Kathy Dowd Commissioner Jody Leight

Commissioner Brandon Matthews

Commissioner Bruce Meyer Commissioner Janice Morrell Commissioner Troy Simmons

Commissioner Abdiel Velez (left at 10:07pm) Commissioner Karen Wells (left at 10:06pm)

Also Present:

Joyce L. Lanier, Secretary Janine G. Bauer, Attorney Richard Wolff, Zoning Officer Shawna Ebanks, Nishuane Group

Absent:

Commissioner Yolanda Silverio

The Secretary states that the requirement of N.J. S.A. 10:4-9 et. seq., "Sunshine Law" has been met. A notice of this meeting was published in the Record-Transcript and sent to the Star Ledger on October 27, 2016 posted on the Bulletin Board in City Hall and the Office of the City Clerk.

NEW BUSINESS

a) Resolution 5-2017 – A resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness approval to Michael Milone for Block 4201, Lot 12 for various exterior renovations (258-264 Central Avenue)

Commissioner Brandon Matthews was absent so he is unable to vote. This resolution adopted this 19th day of April, 2017 memorializes the action taken at a meeting of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission with the roll call vote on the memorialization as follows:

Motion: Commissioner Jody Leight Second: Commissioner Janice Morrell

YeaNayAbstainedAbsentCommissioner Keith Carrol☒Commissioner Kathy Dowd☒

Commissioner Jody Leight	X	
Commissioner Brandon Matthews		X
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X	
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio		X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez		X
Commissioner Karen Wells	\boxtimes	

Resolution 6-2017 – A resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness approval to Community Asset Preservation Corporation for Block 6210, Lot 15 for roof replacement (666 Langdon Street)

Commissioner Brandon Matthews was absent so he is unable to vote.

This resolution adopted this 19th day of April, 2017 memorializes the action taken at a meeting of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission with the roll call vote on the memorialization as follows:

Motion: Commissioner Kathy Dowd Second: Commissioner Janice Morrell

<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	Abstained	Absent
X			
X			
X			
			\mathbf{X}
X			
X			
			X
X			
			X
X			
	X X X X	X	X

c) Resolution 7-2017 – A resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness approval to Darryl Banks for Block 5301, Lot 61 for various repairs for the rear of the house (472 Berkeley Avenue)

Commissioner Brandon Matthews was absent so he is unable to vote.

This resolution adopted this 19th day of April, 2017 memorializes the action taken at a meeting of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission with the roll call vote on the memorialization as follows:

Motion: Commissioner Bruce Meyer Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd

	Yea	Nay	Abstained	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				X
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X			

Commissioner Yolanda Silverio		X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez		X
Commissioner Karen Wells	X	

d) Certificate Of Appropriateness Application - 576 Seven Oaks Road

(Carry Over from 3/15/17) The Arc of Essex County, Inc. at 123 Naylon Ave., Livingston, NJ 07039 made application on March 3, 2017 for front and rear walkway, replacement of window on the front fascia side of property and new railing on new walkway. Troy Rhodes (Applicant Representative) presented further investigations. A request was submitted to the Division of Developmental Disabilities Capital Review Committee by The Arc of Essex County Inc. on November 9, 2016 for renovation funds and the request was approved for \$120,000. The renovations are to include the installation of exterior concrete patio, walkway and ramp replacement of interior flooring, and creation of an additional bedroom. Singular walkway and ramp, He wants to use A1-01, Site Plan, Materials cement concrete, existing sidewalk will be returned to lawn, similar wrought iron railing as stated by Attorney Janine Bauer stated, and he plans to landscape after Commissioner Bruce Meyer inquired. Commissioner Troy Simmons stated without switchback 55feet - 77 feet in span. Based upon the representations of the Applicant's representative, Troy Rhodes, demonstrated that Plan A1.01 is the preferred plan, because it presents a single walkway as requested by the HPC in the front yard. The new walkway will be concrete, with new wrought iron railings (similar to existing). The current front sidewalk path will be removed and returned to lawn area thus obviating the switchback plan which was not acceptable. The grade will be acceptable and there will be only one intermediate landing. Lighting will be added as well as landscaping, making the walkway more attractive and in keeping with the other residences in the historic district of Montrose-Seven Oaks.

Motion: Commissioner Jody Leight Second: Commissioner Troy Simmons

	<u>Yea</u>	Nay	Abstained	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X			
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X			
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X			
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X			
Commissioner Karen Wells	X			

e) Certificate of Appropriateness Application - 463 Hillside Avenue

(Carry Over from 3/15/17) Walter Lalvay and Jaime Morocho made application on February 22, 2017 for replacement of roof and siding. Commissioner Abdiel Velez was sworn by Attorney Bauer to translate truthfully and accurately for Mr. Morocho, who did not speak English. The Applicants obtained permits some months ago from the City in good faith, and paid over \$6,000 for the material (vinyl siding) which was delivered to the job site. In accordance with plans based on the permit, the Applicant removed the then-existing vinyl siding from the house. The roof is now replaced and the windows have been replaced. The vinyl siding was not completed but the

material was purchased. Mr. Lalvay testified that the vinyl siding was on the house before his purchase of it. The Applicant introduced an exhibit, A-1, consisting of 13 different photographs of the home, front and rear and various areas needing work, and a second exhibit A-2, which was a survey by William held Assoc., Inc. dated March 1, 2017. At the last meeting Mr. Monodro was instructed to bring in pictures. Commissioner Janine Morrell took a site visit and Commissioner Karen Wells agrees with Commissioner Morrell that the clap board could be repaired, and restoration would be better than vinyl. Commissioner Troy Simmons raised the concern that allowing this historic word work to be encapsulated with vinyl would not preserve the historic detail. Commissioner Bruce Meyer asked if an exceptions should be granted to grandfather this case in because it was not an intent to cause harm. Attorney Bauer reminded Jaime that ignorance of the law is not an excuse and asked if the work had begun, Jamie purchased had materials six months ago and they have been in storage after the permit was obtained. The permit was issued in error, 11/2016. The question was, would the siding endanger the structure life of the building, and the answer was no. Commissioner Morrell stated that the house had vinyl before so he would actually just be replacing what was there. Attorney Bauer stated that the design guidelines is not clear on this matter and how to address this situation. The guidelines were read from the agenda and would stipulate in formal resolution concerning specific guidelines for Jaime. There was a discussion of what proofs are required to be demonstrated, and the Commission was referred to #2 of the Design Guidelines which have been incorporated into the HPC enabling ordinance by references. A question was raised as to the decorative millwork, and the Applicant was requested to keep it intact. Based upon the representations of the Applicant, the house needs roof replacement in portions where damage has occurred. The Applicant agreed to replace the roof with the same color and materials that exists now. The shingles and sheathing will be ripped off in areas where there are holes and the damaged portions will be cut out and replaced with plywood where needed; these areas will be re-sheathed and re-shingled with three-tabbed asphalt shingles in a color that will match the existing light gray (Applicant showed the Commission a Owens Corning Aspen Grey shingle). As to the vinyl siding, Attorney Bauer re-read the three-prong test from the section from the Design Guidelines in the minutes of the March 15, 2017 meeting, describing what Mr. Lalvay and Mr. Morocho were required to prove to the Commission, which had been pointed out to Applicant at the March 15, 2017 meeting. The Commission agreed that the Applicant would not endanger the structure by the application of the new vinyl siding, however there was debate as to whether he would be allowed to obscure the trim, which was the second prong of the test. Ultimately, the Applicant agreed to install, repair or replace the wooden front scallop materials with like kind wood materials, to replace the windows, window casings and trim around the windows with wood, to clad the "tower" portion of the house in wood, and to install, repair or replace the transition area in the front of the house between the siding and the scalloped area with wood, such that the only area that may be clad in vinyl siding is the lower portion of the front of the house, and the sides and rear walls. There is no subdivision, variance, waiver or exception relief requested or granted here. Based upon the compromise reached by the Commission because of the previously-issued City permit, the Commission believed that the Application and plans are consistent with and meet all of the requirements of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission Ordinance Number 22-2-15, and Chapter 210, Article X, adopted 9-3-2013 by Ordinance Number 34-2013, and the standards therein, and the City Master Plan.

Motion: Commissioner Brandon Matthews Second: Commissioner Karen Wells

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	Abstained	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			

Commissioner Jody Leight	X		
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X		
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	\mathbf{X}		
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X		
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio			X
Commissioner Troy Simmons		X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X		
Commissioner Karen Wells	X		

f) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 664 Valley Street

(Carry Over from 3/15/17) Leon Brown made application to restore the base structure, missing shingles and deck including posts and stairs, and restore rear of structure on April 11, 2017. The goal is to restore the property to the original state. Based upon the representations of the Applicant, Leon Brown, that he will restore the home to its original state, will repair or replace the rotting or rotten materials with like kind wood materials and shingles, and will bring it up to code, the Commission found that the Application was in order and it was appropriate to issue an approval. The Applicant was complimented on the Application because of the numerous photographs presented and Plan set including detailed drawings.

Motion: Commissioner Brandon Matthews		Second: Commissioner Karen Well		
	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X			
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X			
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X			
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X			
Commissioner Karen Wells	X			

g) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 256 Highland Avenue

Angel L. Lozada made application for roof replacement on March 20, 2017. Based upon the representations of the Applicant's Representative, Angel L. Lozada, the Applicant will replace the roof, as it is leaking and causing interior water damage, with the GAF roofing materials presented in the photograph, in a color that will coordinate with the existing siding of the house.

Motion: Commissioner Jody Leight Second: Commissioner Bruce Meyer

		<u>Yea</u>	Nay	Abstained	Absent
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X				
Commissioner Jody Leight	X				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X				
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X				
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X				
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X	
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X				
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X				
Commissioner Karen Wells	X				

h) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 489 Conover Terrace.

To adopt with the condition previously recorded into the record. Community Asset Preservation Corporation, 108 Church Street, 3rd floor, New Brunswick, New Jersey 0890 made application for replacement of rotted porch columns, decking, posts and window replacement on April 12, 2017. Based upon the representations of the Applicant's Representative, Daniel Korbownik, the Applicant made an emergency repair to the front porch decking, stairs and posts to allow for access to the structure. Now, the Applicant desires to restore the property and agreed, after much discussion with the Commission, to replace the rotted porch columns with circular pillars in the same doric design, made or either wood or composite materials that look like wood, to replace the posts on the porch balustrade with closely-spaced simple slats of a lower height, such as were original, instead of the colonial decorating railings of a higher height, to restore the steps to the original wood or to use limestone slabs on the front steps with a brick base, to replace the windows with wood windows or wood-encased windows of the same size, with the same number and size panes or lights (one over one), to use inside storm windows, and otherwise agree to follow the Design Guidelines adopted by City Council in the restoration of this beautiful home. These will be conditions of the approval herein.

Motion: Commissioner Karen Wells Second: Commissioner Keith Carrol

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	Abstained	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews		X		
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X			
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X
Commissioner Troy Simmons		X		
Commissioner Abdiel Velez		X		
Commissioner Karen Wells	X			

i) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 348 Main Street – Library Mural Motion to carry over to the next meeting.

Motion: Commissioner Karen Wells Second: Commissioner Keith Carrol

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	Abstained	Absent
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X			
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X			
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X			
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X			
Commissioner Karen Wells	X			

j) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 330 Heywood Avenue

Danbar Augustus made application on April 11, 2017to remove asphalt shingles from roof and shake wood replacing with timber, plywood and asphalt. There is leaking to the interior of the home. Based upon the representations of the Applicant's representative, Dunbar Augustus, the roof is leaking and there is active water penetration. He wants to remove the asphalt shingle roof and wood shakes, install plywood and dimensional shingles, GAF, Timberlake, in a color that will match the existing garage. The Applicant agrees to proceed in accordance with the Application and to use all like-kind materials.

Motion: Commissioner Bruce Meyer	Second: Commissioner Keith Carrol
----------------------------------	-----------------------------------

	<u>Yea</u>	Nay	Abstained	Absent
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X			
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X			
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X			
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X			
Commissioner Karen Wells	X			

k) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 56 Bell Street

Jose Chaura made application on April 11, 2017 to remove old siding and install new vinyl, replace and repair roof with timber shingles because of leaking, and replace front windows. Jose stated previous permits were taken out to fix siding, and this permit is to complete the remaining parts with vinyl and the roof will be replaced matching colors as closely as possible. It is noted the windows will be vinyl and the same size. Based upon the representations of the Applicant's representative, Jose Chaura, the Applicant want to apply vinyl siding, to the lower half of the front of the house and to apply vinyl siding to the other three walls (two sides and rear) of the house. Apparently, according to the Applicant's testimony, four years ago, he applied for and received the permit from the City, but did not proceed with the work. The permit expired and so he re-applied. There was existing aluminum siding when he obtained the original permit on top of a coat of stucco plaster. He testified that the windows and stucco is in poor condition from water intrusion. The stucco is cracking. The Commission members observed that this is the problem with siding, the water leaks into the troughed windows and crevices, and damages the underlying materials and structure. Essentially, it was observed that Mr. Chaura now has a house encased within a house because of the covering stucco. After discussions with the Commission, the Applicant agreed to replace the existing vinyl front window with a window of the same size, with the same number of panes or lights, except that snapin type dividers will be allowed. The Applicant further agreed to apply vinyl siding to all sides of the house, and to remove all of the stucco plaster. The house will have a uniform, vinyl siding all around. There will be no mixture of stucco and vinyl. All of the stucco will be removed. These are the conditions of the approval.

Motion: Commissioner Kathy	amissioner Kathy Dowd			Second: Commissioner Brandon Ma		
	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	Abstained	Absent		
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X					

\mathbf{X}			
X			
X			
X			
X			
			X
	X		
X			
X			
	X X X	X X X X	X X X X

l) Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 495 Main Street

David Tseitlin for Elmora 2002, LLC. Made application on 4/13/82017 for removing and replacing wall with like kind material and retaining look. Face brick, cinder block footing, and all the front facing wall is brick. The existing use of the property is residential apartments and it is located next to the Dunkin' Donuts shop. The property has a retaining wall which the owner seeks to reconstruct. The Tax Map ID is Block 2301, Lot 39, and the property is located at 495 Main Street, in the Main Street Historic District. Based upon the representations of the Applicant's representative, David Tseitlin and Elmora 2002, LLC want to remove and replace the existing retaining wall at the property with like kind materials. The Applicant's representative represented that the property will look the same as now, and he described the cinderblock footing with brick upper on the masonry section, concrete cap, and the front facing walk. The existing fence is straight on top now, and the plan shows a curved top of the metal portion of the fence atop the masonry. The Commission requested that the fence be built as it is now with a straight line top of fence, not curved, and the Applicant's representative agreed. This will require an amendment to sheet S-102 on the plan set submitted by the engineer. With that change, the Commission approved of the project. The fence material will be wrought iron and not wood.

Motion: Commissioner Brandon Matthews Second: Commissioner Karen Wells

	<u>Yea</u>	Nay	Abstained	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			
Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X			
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X			
Commissioner Janice Morrell	\mathbf{X}			
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X			
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X			
Commissioner Karen Wells	\mathbf{x}			

m) Approval of the Minutes from the March 15, 2017 meeting

Motion: Commissioner Brandon Matthews		Second: Commissioner Karen Wells		
	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	Abstained	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Keith Carrol	X			
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	X			
Commissioner Jody Leight	X			

Commissioner Brandon Matthews	X	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	X	
Commissioner Janice Morrell	X	
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio		X
Commissioner Troy Simmons	X	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez	X	
Commissioner Karen Wells	X	

VI Pending Business/Further Discussion

Board of Education – Update

V Other Business

Commissioner Troy Simmons stated that the board needed to have more dialogue with the residents of Orange Township.

The establishment of Committees, Technical Review Committee, to streamline the process. The Zoning Officer, Richard Wolff make a report to commission saying application was reviewed and approved. Three Architects would tag team and the Zoning Officer and Planning Representative.

It was concluded that a procedure should be drafted and Bauer will take the lead.

Motion: Commissioner Jody Leight Second: Commissioner Troy Simmons

Adjourn Meeting:

Motion to Adjourn: Commissioner Bruce Meyer Second: Commissioner Keith Carrol

Adjournment: 10:34pm

Approved:

Joyce L. Lanier

Secretary

Karen Wells