

City of Orange Township
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

February 21, 2018

The Secretary announced that this is a meeting of Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Orange Township held at City Hall in Council Chambers, 29 North Day Street, Orange New Jersey on Wednesday, February 21, 2018 at 7:36 p.m.

The Secretary asked all to stand for the Pledge of Allegiance to the American Flag

ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioner Keith Carroll
Commissioner Kathy Dowd
Commissioner Jody Leight
Commissioner Bruce Meyer
Commissioner Janice Morrell arrived at 7:44 p.m.
Commissioner Karen Wells

Also Present: Joyce L. Lanier, Secretary
Janine G. Bauer, Attorney
Shawna Ebanks, Nishuane Group
Richard Wolff, Zoning Officer

Absent: Commissioner Brandon Matthews
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio
Commissioner Troy Simmons
Commissioner Abdiel Velez

The Secretary states that the requirement of N.J.S.A. 10:4-9 et. seq., "Sunshine Law" has been met. A notice of this meeting was published in the Record-Transcript and sent to the Star Ledger on January 4, 2018 posted on the Bulletin Board in City Hall and the Office of the City Clerk.

MEETING MINUTES

- **January 17, 2018 Meeting**
(Commissioners Morrell, Silverio and Wells were not in attendance and cannot vote.)

Motion: Commissioner Bruce Meyer **Second:** Commissioner Keith Carroll

Roll Call

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Jody Leight	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Janice Morrell					<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio					<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Commissioner Troy Simmons				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Karen Wells					<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Minutes approved.

NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 513 Stetson Street, Orange, N.J. (Air conditioning condenser)

Secretary Lanier advised applicant was not present and will go to next item.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Continuation of Application) – 512 Jefferson Street, Orange, N.J. (Proposed Front Façade and proposed front yard)

Secretary Lanier advised that this was a continuation application for 512 Jefferson Street from the January 17, 2018 meeting, wherein the Commission requested the applicant come back with drawings of the front façade and the front yard.

Maury Winkler, Esq. appeared and provided drawings of the front façade and the front yard. He advised that on the left side, there was existing paving that came through the yard. The drawings propose a single car driveway on the front of the building with, as much, grass as there is now with planted flowers. The proposed façade will be vinyl siding up top with new brick on the bottom. Stairs on porch with the Corinthian columns removing the wrought iron keeping it consistent with the historical look of the neighborhood.

Attorney Bauer asked what wrought iron is being removed and Mr. Winkler advised that it was the wrought iron posts. The short stair railing will now be connected to posts and a brick façade will be added. Mr. Winkler confirmed that the slope of the stairway on the drawings looks steeper than they are and they want to keep and repair stairs. Attorney Bauer noted that the stairs on the drawings are different from the stairs on the property. In addition, the proposed front façade drawing is different from the other drawing. Mr. Winkler confirmed that the width of the doorway and staircase will both stay the same.

Commissioner Meyer inquired as to the siding material. He recalled that the dormer siding was approved with like-kind material. Mr. Winkler advised they would like to use vinyl siding, but was informed that vinyl is unacceptable and in violation of the HPC's ordinance. Attorney Bauer inquired as to what is the existing material being used and Mr. Winkler advised it is an asphalt type of shingle. Commissioner Meyer reassured Mr. Winkler that the Commission has not approved vinyl siding since it is an unacceptable material and there are other materials that are not vinyl that can be used such as fiber cement board.

Attorney Bauer read into the record that the Commission agrees to the driveway, front landscaping, fencing with gate for the car, as well as, the walkway, existing stairs to be rebuilt or replaced with in-kind material with the brick veneer and replacement posts.

Commissioner Meyer inquired as to the material of the fence and Mr. Winkler advised that the fence should not have been there and will not be used.

Motion to approve the application as Attorney Bauer just read into the record what the conditions were.

Motion: Commissioner Jody Leight

Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Jody Leight	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Janice Morrell	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Troy Simmons				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Karen Wells	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				

Motion approved.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – McDonalds, 145-147 Main Street, Orange, N.J.

Joe Sparone, Principle of Dynamic Engineering located at Chester, New Jersey. Mr. Sparone advised that there is currently a McDonalds at the intersection of Main Street and Park Street. This project will include the demolition of both the McDonalds and the adjacent 3-story commercial building wherein both properties will be combined for the purpose of the project. McDonalds is 2,035 square feet and the commercial building is 6,331 square feet.

Proposed site plan C-4 dated October 18, 2018 is a complete raised and rebuild of McDonalds. There is a nationwide initiative to change all McDonalds. This McDonalds will be bigger at 3,947 square feet. The adjacent property is in the process of being purchased. Key features include side-by-side drive thru, which will help with the efficiency of drive thru. It will feature an elevated

pedestrian access. Create a sidewalk from street to building with various pavement features including benches, planters, and green space. A cleaner and contemporary look using natural materials. The goal is to make McDonalds more inviting.

Commissioner Wells stated the location is in a historic district and it does not fit into landscape.

Commissioner Meyer stated design is acceptable for the area and inquired about the building next door and conditions. Zoning Officer advised condition is poor and has no historical value.

Applicant advised that there would also be a rain garden in a sizable triangular. Commissioner Wells stated it would have a Lincoln Park London look.

Commissioner Morrell inquired what the original site was like.

Commissioner Wells history of Orange. Photo 16 and difference of proposed plan. Removing curbs from roadway on Main Street. Sidewalk-street scape design will carry straight through the building.

Attorney Bauer – C-10 – inquired where does the pedestrian access the front door and where is the elevation. Applicant advised 6 to 8 inches difference.

Attorney Bauer inquired if the driveway is asphalt. Applicant replied the drive thru will be concrete. Attorney Bauer further inquired if drive thru will be permitted by Zoning – conditional use. Zoning Officer advised it would just need sight plan approval.

Attorney Bauer inquired testimony or exhibit that the design or use of material is in time with material that already on street on Main Street. Applicant advised it would be full brick façade with aluminum tralus and canopy systems.

Commissioner Carroll inquired is the rendering you are showing set in stone. Applicant advised it is what we are submitting.

Commissioner Meyer inquired what your position is. Applicant advised he is a professional consultant not employed by McDonalds.

Attorney Bauer suggested structure next-door represent what it looks like during its area. Can you incorporate more features into your design? Maybe using more limestone features in the front and adding more features with materials you are currently using. Requested more windows.

Commissioner Meyer suggested they use the design elements from the building they are taking down.

Attorney Bauer suggested drive thru side elevations a lot more window towards the front. Applicant stated he could look at other architectural options. Elevations do not really show the extensive landscaping and rain garden.

Commissioner Meyer – rain garden is not the street side.

Attorney Bauer on Exhibit C-7 – four or five trees and low plants maybe you can add features. Applicant advised they could add trees and sizable plants. Rain garden is for a run off feature.

Commissioner Wells inquired if they were doing any railings. Applicant said they would be a black decorative aluminum fence on Park Street. Front decorative ballar with more features. Commissioner Wells suggested that for the Main Street stone front they should look at the Bergen County Palisade building.

Attorney Bauer advised the Commissioners that if we have to put up with the drive thru then the building should look like it belongs on Main Street.

The Commission suggested the applicant come back with different renditions.

Motion to carry application and return at the March 21, 2018 meeting.

Motion: Commissioner Keith Carroll

Second: Commissioner Karen Wells

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Jody Leight	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Janice Morrell	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Troy Simmons				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Karen Wells	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				

Motion approved.

Applicant inquired as to what is the process. Secretary Lanier advised that he should go back to McDonalds, get different renditions, and email to her and she will then distribute to the Commission. If there are any questions, they will be asked before the meeting.

**D. Certificate of Appropriateness Application – 513 Stetson Street, Orange, N.J.
(Air conditioning condenser)**

Secretary Lanier advised that applicant was not present. The applicant wants to place the air conditioning condenser on the roof of the building.

Attorney Bauer recommended that if the applicant wants to replace the air conditioning condenser on the roof and, as long as, it is not more than 10% or 15% larger and not viewed from the front of the building we can administratively approve it. If it is more than 20% or larger and viewed from the front, then they have to come back.

Motion: _____ **Second:** _____

I. CONSENT AGENDA

ALL ITEMS LISTED WITH AN ASTERISK (*) ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE BY THE COMMISSION AND WILL BE ENACTED BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COMMISSONER SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE OF THE AGENDA.

***1-2018 A Resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness for 324 Carteret Place, Block 4804, Lot 8 to restore front porch, replace roof and install missing stair.**

***2-2018 A Resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness for 592 Beach Street, Block 6202, Lot 4 to replace existing vinyl siding with vinyl siding.**

(The following Commissioners were absent on the meeting of January 17, 2018 and cannot vote – Commissioners Morrell, Silverio and Wells) (Commissioners that can vote: Carroll, Dowd, Leight, Matthews, Meyer, Simmons, and Velez)

Motion to adopt consent agenda.

Motion: Commissioner Bruce Meyer

Second: Commissioner Kathy Dowd

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Jody Leight	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Janice Morrell			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio					<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Commissioner Troy Simmons				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Karen Wells			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		

Motion approved.

Item *3-2018 removed from Consent Agenda for a separate vote.

***3-2018 A Resolution of the City of Orange Township Historic Preservation Commission granting Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the structure at 396 Clarendon Place, Block 4902, Lot 2, and to make certain parking and other site improvements to 366 Clarendon Place, Block 4902, Lot 5, 386 Clarendon Place, Block 4902, Lot 3 and 396 Clarendon Place, Block 4902, Lot 2.**

Attorney Bauer advised the Commission that she has spoken with the Business Administrator and he has expressed some concern about the conditions of the approval and she tried to walk him through. Ms. Bauer is concerned that Mr. Randal did not attend meeting.

Ms. Bauer recommended the Commission to approve the application since the Commission has done everything they can do. If there is a problem in the future, they can come back and we can do an amended resolution.

Motion: Commissioner Bruce Meyer

Second: Commissioner Keith Carroll

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Jody Leight	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Janice Morrell			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Troy Simmons				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Karen Wells			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		

Motion approved.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

- A. ZONING OFFICER APPROVAL – NONE
- B. PROPOSED HORIZON TELECOM SMALL – CELL TELECOMMUNICATIONS ARRAYS BERGEN, ESSEX, HUDSON, AND UNION COUNTIES

Secretary Lanier informed the Commission that Horizon has sent correspondence to advise that they will be selling telecommunications arrays in Bergen, Essex, Hudson and Union counties. Horizon is proposing adding cell towers on existing poles in Orange specifically in the Valley section. There is no action to be taken by the Commission at this time and the information provided is just informative.

VIII. PENDING BUSINESS

The short form guidelines was discussed amongst the Commissioners.

Adjourn Meeting:

Motion to Adjourn: Commissioner Keith Carroll Second: Commissioner Jody Leight

	<u>Yea</u>	<u>Nay</u>	<u>Abstained</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>NP</u>
Commissioner Keith Carroll	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Kathy Dowd	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Jody Leight	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Brandon Matthews				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Bruce Meyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Janice Morrell	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
Commissioner Yolanda Silverio				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Troy Simmons				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Abdiel Velez				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Commissioner Karen Wells	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				

Adjournment Time: 9:22 p.m.

Approved:



Joyce L. Lanier
Secretary



Karen Wells
Chairs